



**THE DEVELOPMENT OF HADITH STUDY  
CONTROVERSY IN INDONESIA:  
A STUDY OF *MIṢBĀḤ AL-ẒULĀM* BY MUHAJIRIN  
AMSAR AL-DARI**

**Fatihunnada**

Fakultas Dirasat Islamiyah, UIN Syarif Hidayatullah Jakarta

e-mail: [fatihunnada@uinjkt.ac.id](mailto:fatihunnada@uinjkt.ac.id)

**Abstract:** There has been a wide presumption that hadith literature authored by Indonesian Muslim scholars is simple and static. This article challenges this view. It examines *Miṣbāḥ al-Ẓulām*, a commentary of *Bulūḡ al-Marām*, by Muhajirin Amsar al-Dari to show the dynamic development of the study on *ikhtilāf al-ḥadīth* (disputes over hadith). Grounded in the hermeneutic approach, this article argues that the development of hadith studies in Indonesia from time to time is not as simple as the general presupposition entails. This article shows that the development of hadith studies is raised following the provision of studies on *ikhtilāf al-ḥadīth*. The tradition of writing hadith in Indonesia began in the 17<sup>th</sup> century and, as a result, a number of hadith literatures have been produced by Indonesian Muslim scholars. This development challenges some scholars' perception that the studies of hadith in Indonesia remain simple and the science of hadith in the country is hardly available.

**Keywords:** Development of hadith, contradiction of hadith, Muhajirin Amsir, *Miṣbāḥ al-Ẓulām*, Indonesia

**DOI:** <http://dx.doi.org/10.20414/ujis.v21i2.276>

## Introduction

SCHOLARS SUGGEST that the study of hadith in Indonesia does not thrive well. This can be seen from the fact that the books and literature used in Islamic boarding school are only the books of Islamic law (*fiqh*), language, theology (*ushuluddin*), Sufism, and

interpretation (*tafsir*).<sup>1</sup> Meanwhile, the book of *Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhārī* is only made as a reference by Muslim clerics.<sup>2</sup> Thus, it implies that the expertise of Indonesian Muslim scholars in the field of hadith is inadequate. Such a phenomenon has led scholar to doubt the involvement and contribution of Indonesian Muslim scholars in the field of hadith.<sup>3</sup> To respond to such doubt, it is necessary to present a comprehensive study that explores hadith literature authored by Muslim scholars emerging from the country. Therefore, such existing work needs studying critically, including those from the early period.<sup>4</sup> Indonesian Muslim clerics have actually published a myriad of studies pertinent to hadith,<sup>5</sup> which demonstrates their mastery in the sphere of hadith and scientific of hadith.<sup>6</sup>

The current study aims to delineate the development of studies on hadith in Indonesia throughout the 20<sup>th</sup> century.<sup>7</sup> In

<sup>1</sup> Van den Berg in Karel A. Steenbrink, "Beberapa Aspek Tentang Islam di Indonesia Abad 19," in *Beberapa Aspek tentang Islam di Indonesia Abad 19* (Jakarta: Bulan Bintang, 1984), 155–157.

<sup>2</sup> Martin van Bruinessen, *Kitab Kuning Pesantren dan Tarekat, Tradisi-Tradisi Islam di Indonesia* (Bandung: Mizan, 1999), 29.

<sup>3</sup> Martin van Bruinessen, "A Note on Source Materials for The Biographies of Southeast Asian Ulama," *La Transmission du Savoir Dans le Monde Musulman Peripherique, Lettre d'information* 17 (1997): 57–66.

<sup>4</sup> In an article written by Abd. Moqsiṭh Ghazali that describes about the marginalized position of non-Arabian scholars, and that their works are considered invalid, because non-Arabians are regarded as 'ajam (stranger) and not able to understand Islamic lessons in depth. See Abdul Moqsiṭh Ghazali, "Ulama Arab dan Ulama Indonesia," *Islamlib*, last modified Oktober 2008, accessed February 11, 2016, <http://islamlib.com/gagasan/islamnusantara/ulama-arab-dan-ulama-indonesia/>.

<sup>5</sup> A complete statement can be seen in the notes by Abdur-Rahman M.A. et al. that explain the works of Muslim clerics from Southaeast Asia, exactly from Malay Peninsula, and among those works, ones which written by Indonesian Muslim clerics are quite dominat. See M.A. Abdur-Rahman et al., "Historical Review of Classical Hadith Literature in Malay Peninsula," *International Journal of Basic and Applied Sciences* 11, no. 2 (2011).

<sup>6</sup> See Fauzi bin Deraman and Mohd Asma wi bin Muhammad, "Karya-Karya 'Ulum al-Hadith di Nusantara: Satu Sorotan," *Al-Bayan Journal of Qur'an and Hadith Studies* 8 (2013): 14.

<sup>7</sup> Brown shows that al-Daruqutni was one of the critical hadith in sahihayn. This means that controversy over the hadith is not novel in the tradition of Islam. See Jonathan A. C. Brown, "Criticism of the Proto-Hadith Canon: Al-Daraquṭnī's

particular, this research describes the origins of early history of *mukhtalāf al-ḥadīth* study development in Indonesia and the background of its emergence. For this reason, this study measures to what extent the study of hadith has so far been appealing in Indonesia. It also analyzes the methodology used to understand *mukhtalāf al-ḥadīth* in Indonesia throughout the 20<sup>th</sup> century regarding the measurement of Indonesian Muslim scholars in addressing the study of hadith and the disputes surrounding it.

This present study is a continuation of the previous studies on this topic and related issues. Jawiah Dakir and Ahmad Levi Fachrul Avivy<sup>8</sup> explain that the Muslim scholars in Nusantara have their special excellence and style in understanding hadith. However, this study only gives an introduction about the figure of Muhajirin Amsar and a little review of the methodology of hadith commentary of *Miṣbāḥ al-Zulām*. Oman Fathurrahman<sup>9</sup> traced again the roots of writing tradition of hadith works in Nusantara by focusing on the study of *Hidāyat al-Ḥabīb* and some other hadith works. Muhammad Mustaqim Mohd Zarif in 'Jawah Hadis Scholarship in the Nineteenth Century: A Comparative Study of the Adaptions of *Lubāb al-Ḥadīth* composed by Nawawi of Banten (d. 1314/1897) and Wan 'Ali of Kelantan (d. 1331/1913) (2007)<sup>10</sup> researched the similarities and differences between both said works in the method and approach to understand hadith and the language used.

---

Adjustment of the Sahihayn," *Journal of Islamic Studies* 15, no. 1 (January 1, 2004): 1–37.

<sup>8</sup> See Jawiah Dakir and Ahmad Levi Fachrul Avivy, "Ketokohan Sheikh Muhammad Muhajirin Amsar Al-Dary Sebagai Ilmuan Hadis Nusantara: Analisis Terhadap Kitab *Miṣbāḥ Al-Zulām Sharḥ Bulūḡ Al-Marām*," in *Prosiding Nadwah Ulama Nusantara (NUN) IV* (Bangi, Selangor: University Kebangsaan Malaysia, 2011), 231–236, <http://www.ukm.my/nun/prosiding%20atas%20talian.htm>.

<sup>9</sup> Oman Fathurrahman, "The Roots of the Writing Tradition of Ḥadīth Works in Nusantara: *Hidāyat Al-Ḥabīb* by Nūr Al-Dīn Al-Rānīrī," *Studi Islamika Indonesian Journal for Islamic Studies* 19, no. 1 (2012): 47–76.

<sup>10</sup> Muhammad Mustaqim Mohd. Zarif, "Jawah Hadis Scholarship in the Nineteenth Century: A Comparative Study of the Adaptions of *Lubāb Al-Ḥadīth* Composed by Nawawi of Banten (d. 1314/1897) and Wan 'Ali of Kelantan (d. 1331/1913)" (Dissertation, University of Edinburgh, 2007).

Syuhudi Ismail explains that each Muslim scholar has different methods of solving the disputes (*ikhtilāf*) over hadith. A Muslim scholar may use one method, while others adopt more than one method. However, it does not mean that the result of their study must be different one another. Although they use different methods, the final result in solving such *ikhtilāf* may sometimes show many similarities.<sup>11</sup>

In solving the contradiction or disputes (*ikhtilāf*) of hadith, the majority of hadith experts have set out four theories in hierarchical order, not as an option: First, the method of *al-jam' wa al-tawfiq*; second, *al-naskh*; third, *al-tarjih*; and fourth, *tawaqquf*. However, in the theory of Shafi'i, there is no principle of *al-tawaqquf*,<sup>12</sup> which is what another Muslim scholar does as the last alternative regarding a conflicting proposition that cannot be compromised and resolved with the method of *al-naskh* or *al-tarjih*. The explanation of those four steps can be seen as follow:

In addressing the contradiction or *Mukhtalaf al-Hadith*, the first step that is usually taken by the Muslim scholars is by applying the method of *al-Jam' wa al-Tawfiq* (compromise). It means that *mukhtalaf hadith* can be solved by discovering the points of convergence in each content of meaning. Thus, the essential meaning addressed by those hadith can be revealed.<sup>13</sup> The second method is *al-naskh* (abrogation), which is understood as a fact that some *mukhtalaf al-hadith* has provision content with similar topic, but it brings opposite meaning and it cannot be compromised.<sup>14</sup>

Another method is *al-tarjih*, formulated by the Muslim scholars and defined as "the method of comparing the propositions that are seemingly contradictory in order to know which has a strong argument or position than the other one". Yet, only a few Muslim scholars state that *tarjih* on *mukhtalaf hadith* can

---

<sup>11</sup> M. Syuhudi Ismail, *Hadis Nabi Menurut Pembela, Peningkar, dan Pemalsunya* (Jakarta: Bulan Bintang, 1995), 111–113.

<sup>12</sup> Muḥammad ibn Idrīs Al-Shāfi'ī, *Al-Risālat* (Cairo: Maktabat al-Ḥalabi, 1940), 216.

<sup>13</sup> Nafiz Husayn Ḥammād, *Mukhtalaf al-Ḥadīth Bayn al-Fuqahā' wa al-Muḥaddithīn* (Cairo: Dār al-Wafā', 1993), 142.

<sup>14</sup> Muḥammad Adīb Ṣālīḥ, *Lamḥat fī Uṣūl al-Ḥadīth* (Beirut: al-Maktab al-Islāmiyyah, 1978), 84.

be done before firstly approached by the method of *al-jam' wa al-tawfiq*.<sup>15</sup> The fourth method is *al-tawaqquf* (leaving without any provisions). If those three methods above are not possible to be applied in resolving the conflicting hadith, the hadith experts must take a step by not giving any provisions upon such hadith, provided that those hadith are not in contradiction to the matters of halal and haram, compulsory and haram, and sunnah and makruh, which is unlikely accepted both.<sup>16</sup>

Theoretically, I adopt the science of understanding/hermeneutics by Heidegger. Hermeneutic theory is used to understand the meaning of a text as a socio-cultural phenomenon, because in understanding a text, one shall need three subjects, namely the text itself, writer of the text, and reader of the text. The approach of *mukhtalaf al-hadith* developed by hadith expert also becomes the main instrument in this research. Such a method is formulated by hadith experts for understanding some conflicting hadith in order to get the points of convergence from such contradiction. Historical approach is also used to reconstruct the development of hadith study in Indonesia before and after 20<sup>th</sup> century, including the form of popular hadith studies in Indonesia before 20<sup>th</sup> century and any studies developed in the 20<sup>th</sup> century. Hence, this study presents the periodization of hadith study development in Indonesia.

### The Development of Hadith Study in Indonesia

In Nusantara (archipelago), any efforts to revitalize the teachings of the Prophet found in hadith have taken place since the second half of 17<sup>th</sup> century, along with the arrival of renewal ideas (modernization) that emphasize al-Qur'an and hadith as the source of Islamic teachings. The scholars study hadith from inspiration and knowledge on the ways that lead the Muslim society to socio-moral reconstruction. However, until the

---

<sup>15</sup> Hammād, *Mukhtalaf al-Hadith*, 227.

<sup>16</sup> Muḥammad ibn 'Abd al-Raḥmān ibn Muḥammad Al-Sakhāwī, *Fath al-Mugīth bi Sharḥ Alfiyyat al-Hadīth li al-'Irāqī* (Cairo: Maktabah al-Sunnah, 2003), 70.

beginning of 20<sup>th</sup> century, the study of hadith in Indonesia is still less popular.<sup>17</sup>

One of the earliest Malay hadith books, *Hidāyāt al-Habīb al-Targhib wa-al-Tarhīb*, is written by Nuruddin al-Raniri. The lack of studies on the tradition of writing hadith, including upon the text of this *Hidāyāt al-Habīb*, is highly influenced by the limited access to primary sources in the form of handwritten scripts (manuscript) regarding this field. *Hidāyāt al-Habīb* was written on 6 Syawal 1045 H/14 March 1636 M, a book consists of 831 hadith from various sources, such as Bukhārī, Muslim, Turmudhī, and many others.<sup>18</sup>

The study of hadith in Nusantara had shown its existence between the 17<sup>th</sup> and 19<sup>th</sup> century despite being limited. Some scholars discuss the science of hadith in their works, such as hadith classification of *sahih*, *hasan*, and *da'if* notwithstanding its limitness in terms of the number and depth of analysis. For example, in the book of "*Jawaban Syeikh Ahmad bin Muhammad Zayn al-Fatani tentang Hadis Memulai dan Menyudahi Makan dengan Garam*" (the responses of Shaykh Ahmad bin Muhammad Zayn al-Fatani regarding the hadith on the beginning and finishing eating), where Shaykh Ahmad answered such a matter with a long explanation based on the science of *mustalah ḥadīth* while taking into account the *ʿIlm Rijāl al-Ḥadīth*<sup>19</sup>.

In *Tanqīḥ al-Qawl al-Hathīth bi Sharḥ Lubāb al-Ḥadīth*, Nawawi al-Bantani emphasized the importance of transmission (*sanad*) in a hadith by giving emphasis on the names of narrators in determining the validity of transmission. The book of *Maṭāli' al-Anwār wa Majāmi' al-Azhar* by Shaykh Usman Jalal al-Din al-Kalantani discusses the science of hadith in its introduction. The book of *Manhaj Dhawī al-Nazar* by Shaykh Mahfuz al-Tarmasi is a

---

<sup>17</sup> Agung Danarto, *Kajian Hadis di Indonesia Tahun 1900-1945 (Tela'ah terhadap Pemikiran Beberapa Ulama tentang Hadis)* (Yogyakarta: Proyek Perguruan Tinggi Islam IAIN Sunan Kalijaga, 2000), 8.

<sup>18</sup> Read Fathurrahman, "The Roots."

<sup>19</sup> Oman Fathurrahman and Munawar Holil, *Katalog Naskah Ali Hasjmy Aceh* (Jakarta: PPIM dan Yayasan Pendidikan dan Museum Ali Hasjmy Banda Aceh, Masyarakat Komunitas Nusantara [MANASSA], Centre for Documentation and Area-Transcultural Studies [C-DATS], Tokyo University of Foreign Studies [TUFS], 2007), 22.

book of *Mustalah al-Hadith* which is fairly complete. The study on hadith science, including its sanad, is also mentioned by him in his other works, namely *al-Minhah al-Khayriyyah fi Arba 'in Hadith min Ahādīth Khayr al-Bariyyah*, *Kifāyah al-Mustafid fi mā 'Alā min al-Asānīd*.

In addition, the book of *al-Fawaid al-Bahiyyah* by Nuruddin Muhammad ibn Ali ibn Hasanji is also regarded as the work of scholar in Nusantara in the field of hadith during the early period. This book consists of one volume with 332 pages and 831 hadith of Prophet Muhammad SAW. This book was already printed and published in Egypt in 1346 H/1927 M. These 831 hadith are explained or described by using Malay language. Substantively, these hadith are, by its writer, discussing on how to practice the virtues, and conversely, are also presenting hadith of advices on how to stay away from the evil. In other words, it can be said that the hadith contained in this book tend to have relation with the wisdoms of human's experiences in day-to-day life.<sup>20</sup>

Another example is Mahfudz Termas which is known through one of his works, namely *Manhaj Dhawī al-Nazar fi Sharh al-Manzūmāt 'Ilm al-Athar*. This Arabic book is a commentary upon the book of *al-Manzūmāt 'ilm al-Athar* by Jalāl al-Dīn al-Suyūṭī, and it is successfully made Mahfudz Termas as one of the leading scholars in Nusantara, especially in the field of hadith. As a result, such book is referred by many Muslim scholars in Islamic world as a whole.<sup>21</sup>

Afterwards, the works of T.M. Hasbi Ash-Shiddieqy also give another color to the dynamics of hadith study in Nusantara in the beginning of 20<sup>th</sup> century. One of his works is *Sejarah dan Pengantar Ilmu Hadis* (The history and introduction to the science of hadith). This book explains the history in the growth and development and the science of hadith. According to its author, this book is an introduction for *Mutiara Hadith*, which is also composed by this author.

---

<sup>20</sup> Muhajirin, "Transmisi Hadis di Nusantara: Peran Ulama Hadis Nusantara Muḥammad Maḥfūz al-Tarmasī" (Dissertation, UIN Syarif Hidayatullah, 2009), 197.

<sup>21</sup> Read Fathurrahman, "The Roots."

We can observe that within the period of 17<sup>th</sup> to 19<sup>th</sup> century, Islamic education was still given in its simplest form and not systemized yet. No data were found quite representative about the given curriculum of Islamic teachings. The in-depth and formal learning of hadith and *'Ulūm al-Ḥadīth* has been seemingly not been conducted yet. Federspiel added that during the Dutch's colonialization, the study of hadith had not been discussed as an independent discipline of science. At that time, the discussion on hadith still became a part of other Islamic disciplines of science, such as fiqh.<sup>22</sup>

The scholars of 18<sup>th</sup> and 19<sup>th</sup> century continuously showed a large number of similar trends with any trends developed in the previous periods. While the pressure on hadith study continued, the reconciliation between Shari'a and Sufism progressively gained a stronger foundation. A significant development from the eighteenth century was lots of leading scholars giving emphasis on the reconciliation between those four schools of fiqh.<sup>23</sup>

In the early 20<sup>th</sup> century, the hadith books were still not made as source of reference, because this study was considered new in the education in Indonesia, especially in Islamic boarding schools. At that time, the hadith scholars began to give more attention on the study of hadith by collecting the books of hadith to be translated and presented as materials to be taught in educational institutions, such as Madrasa and Islamic boarding school. No books of hadith written by Indonesian scholars in the beginning of 20<sup>th</sup> century made as the basic study of hadith in Islamic boarding school became the evidence at that time. The study of hadith in Indonesia was still in introduction phase.

Until 1980s, there were, at least, four types (genre) of hadith literature in Indonesia. The first type is the literature of hadith science which contains the analysis of any hadith developed in early days of Islam to determine its authenticity and falsity. The second type is the literature of hadith book which translates the

---

<sup>22</sup> Howard M. Federspiel, *The Usage of Tradition of the Prophet in Contemporary Indonesia* (Arizona: Program for SAS, 1993), 5.

<sup>23</sup> Azyumardi Azra, *Jaringan Ulama Timur Tengah dan Kepulauan Nusantara Abad XVII dan XVIII* (Bandung: Mizan, 1998), 163.



books of hadith within the classic era (620-1250) and middle days of Islam (1250-1850). The third type is anthology of the selected hadith taken from various hadith book collections selected and rewritten by Indonesian writers. Further, the fourth type is a collection of hadith used as the source of law and material of teaching in Islamic schools.<sup>24</sup>

On the other hand, a great number of studies on hadith have emerged delineating the content of hadith collected in one master book of hadith or a book of collected hadith. The works of *Al-Khil 'ah al-Fikriyyah Sharḥ al-Minḥah al-Khayriyyah* and *al-Tabyīn al-Rāwī Sharḥ Arba 'in Nawawī*, for example, have given an actual contribution to this field. Both works have added a new color in the study of hadith in Indonesia during the early days of 20<sup>th</sup> century. Analytic method (*Tahlili*) used by Mahfudz al-Tarmasi in explaining the prophet's hadith in his book entitled *Al-Khil 'ah al-Fikriyyah Sharḥ al-Minḥah al-Khayriyyah*, in detailed, along with the description of the biography of hadith narrators, includes the full name, nickname, title, place and date of birth. It also covers address, and death, degree of the hadith, takhrij of the hadith, analysis on words and sentences, as well as various information relating to the hadith. Meanwhile, Kasyful Anwar in his work, *al-Tabyīn al-Rāwī Sharḥ Arba 'in Nawawī*, preferred global method (*Ijmālī*) to the other methods in explaining the hadith by giving emphases on a brief explanation and focusing on the hadith contents. Both works also use the analysis method in explaining hadith, along with language analysis and content analysis that refer to the verses of Al-Qur'an and hadith of the prophet as the basis for its analysis.

### Muhajirin and His Work on Hadith

Muhajirin Amsar al-Dari is one of the scholars of hadith of the early twentieth century of modern Indonesia. He was born and raised in Kampung Baru, Cakung, East Jakarta, on November 24, 1924. When one mentioned a trio of religious science warriors

---

<sup>24</sup> Muh. Tasrif, "Studi Hadis di Indonesia (Telaah Historis terhadap Studi Hadis dari Abad XVII – Sekarang)," *Jurnal Studi Ilmu-ilmu Al-Quran dan Hadis* 5, no. 1 (January 2004): 113.

from Bekasi in the era of 60s, the name of Syaikh Muhammad Muhajirin Amsar al-Dari is one of them, and the rest two are K.H. Noer Ali and K.H. Abdurahman Sodri. In the first Islamic boarding school in Bekasi, in 1963, not far from the location of an Islamic boarding school named Bahagia, Syaikh Muhammad Muhajirin Amsar al-Dari found an Islamic boarding school named Annida Al-Islami<sup>25</sup>.

On 4 Dzulqa'dah of 1366 H or August 1947, Shaykh Muhammad Muhajirin departed from Indonesia by a ship heading to Jeddah from which he performed the pilgrimage to Mecca. The early struggle of Shaykh Muhammad Muhajirin in seeking knowledge began when he lived in the house of Shaykh 'Abdul Ghani Jamal. After staying there for few times, in the middle of the year, he moved to Asrama Jailani located inside "*Mudda 'i*". When he stayed there, at first, he studied to Shaykh Muhammad Ahyad who replaced Shaykh Muchtar al-Tarid al-Jawî at Mosque of al-Haram. In addition, Shaykh Muhammad Muhajirin also learned from other teachers during his study in Mecca and Medina. They are Shaykh Hasan Muhammad al-Masshat, Shaykh Zayni Bawean, Shaykh Muhammad 'Ali b. Husain al-Malikiy, Shaykh Mukhtar Ampetan, Shaykh Syed 'Alawi b. 'Abbas al-Malikiy, Shaykh Ibrahim al-Fataniy, Shaykh Amin al-Qutbiy, Shaykh Ahmad Manshuriy, Shaykh Muhammad Yasin al-Fadaniy, Shaykh Muhammad Amin al-Sinqitiy, and Shaykh 'Abdurrahman al-Afriqiyy. On Thursday, August 6, 1955 or exactly on 19 Safar 1375 Hijriyah, he arrived at the homeland of Indonesia, at the request of his mother. In his effort to practice and spread his knowledge, he established an educational institution and Islamic boarding school from the level of Tsanawiyah (1-3 grades) to University by the name of Annida Al-Islamiy. Shaykh Muhammad Muhajirin died in 2003.<sup>26</sup>

Shaykh Muhammad Muhajirin is a very prolific scholar. He had written about thirty books, and all of them are in Arabic. His

---

<sup>25</sup> Muhammad Muhajirin al-Dari Bekasi Amsar, *Sejarah Singkat Perjalanan Hidup Syeikh Muhammad Muhajirin Amsar Addary* (Bekasi: Pesantren Annida Al-Islamy Bekasi, 2007), 7–20.

<sup>26</sup> *Ibid.*, 5.

work are compulsory resources for the students studying in his Islamic boarding school from the thanawiyah (equivalent to first grade) to almarhalah al-`ulya (equivalent to pre-siswazah). The Annia Islamic boarding school has listed the works of its founder, Syekh Muhammad Muhajirin, as the evidence indicating that the Syekh is a sort of productive Islamic scholar. Aside from being the compulsory sources in the boarding school, his works are also reviewed and learnt in Majlis Taklim and several education institutions in Bekasi and Jakarta he organized. His works are as followings<sup>27</sup>:

1. Mişbāh al-Zulām Sharḥ Bulūḡ al-Marām, 8 Volumes (fiqh hadith)
2. Īdāh al-Mawrūd, 2 Volumes (ushul fiqh)
3. Muḥammad Rasūl Allāh (tarikh/ history)
4. Mir'at Al-Muslmīn fī Sīrat Khulafā' al-Rāshidīn (tarikh/ history)
5. Al-Muntakhab Min Tārīkh Dawlah Umayyah (tarikh/history)
6. Qawā'id al-Khams al-Bahiyyah (qowaid fiqh)
7. Al-Istidhkār (musthalah hadith/ushul hadith)
8. Ta'liqāt 'alā Matn al-Jawharah, 2 Volumes (tauhid)
9. Mukhtārat al-Balāḡah, 2 Volumes (balaghah)
10. Qawā'id al-Naḥwiyyah, 2 Volumes (nahwu/Arabic grammar)
11. Al-Qawl Al-Ḥathīth fī Muṣṭalah Al-Ḥadīth (musthalah hadith/ushul hadith)
12. Taysīr al-Uṣūl fī 'Ilm al-Uṣūl (ushul fiqh)
13. Qawā'id al-Mantiq, 2 Volumes (mantiq)
14. Muṭāla'at Maḥfūẓāt
15. Takhrīj al-Furū' 'alā al-Uṣūl
16. Taṭbīq al-Āyāt bi al-Ḥadīth
17. Al-Fayḍ fī 'Ilm al-Farā'id (faroid)

These work show that his knowledge is not only in one scientific field, but also it includes several Islamic knowledge. All books were printed privately by him. But, this time, some publishers have published some of his works. Unfortunately, his books are not widely known. It is, perhaps, because those books

---

<sup>27</sup> Ibid., 21–22.

were printed independently and not sold widely; thus its spread is only limited to his students and the people that knew him.

The most significant expertise of Shaykh Muhajirin is the study of hadith. He studied long enough to Shaykh Muhammad Yasin bin 'Isa al-Fadani at Dar al-'Ulum, Mecca. Shaykh Muhammad Yasin al-Fadani was known among the world's scholars as one of the greatest *Muḥaddith* of this century. Shaykh Yasin got the epithet as *Suyuti Zamanihi* (Imam Suyuti in his day). In addition, he was also titled as "*Musnid al-Dunya*". It was a very rare title, and even no one had such a title in his era. He had almost all sanad of Islamic scientific books.

The background behind the birth of *Miṣbāḥ al-Zulām* was originated from an admiration of the book of *Bulūgh al-Marām* by Ibn Hajar. In his view, the presence of *Bulūgh al-Marām* as a book of hadith ahkam was a phenomenal work. Shaykh Muhajirin said that lot of scholars after the generation of Ibnu Hajar made his work as a reference in the search of hujjah relating to the law of Islam or the study of hadith of law itself resulting in explanatory books (sharah).

The book of *Miṣbāḥ al-Zulām*, as a script, was written when Shaykh Muhajirin was in Mecca. Then, the improvement of such writing was completed in 1972 and it was firstly published in 1985 by the University of Annida Al-Islamiy. The book of *Miṣbāḥ al-Zulām*, in its old printed version, consisted of eight volumes, in which Volume I had 279 pages, Volume II had 293 pages, Volume III had 270 pages, Volume IV had 258 pages, Volume V had 204 pages, Volume VI had 276 pages, Volume VII had 236 pages, and Volume VIII had 284 pages. Meanwhile, the new version consisted of four volumes, in which Volume I had 408 pages, Volume II had 390 pages, Volume III had 328 pages, and Volume IV had 415 pages. The orders of book, chapter, and the number of the hadith are included in the book of *Bulūgh al-Marām*, consisting of 16 titles of book, 76 titles of chapter, and 1597 hadith.<sup>28</sup> Shaykh Muhajirin himself, in the introduction of his book, told about the main

---

<sup>28</sup> See Muhammad Muhajirin al-Dari Bekasi Amsar, *Miṣbāḥ al-Zulām Sharḥ Bulūgh al-Marām min Adillat al-Aḥkām* (Bekasi, 1991).

reference source in *Miṣbāḥ al-Zulām* was all syarah books of *al-Kutub al-Sittah* plus popular fiqh books and its usul fiqh books.

In general, the syarah conducted by Shaykh Muhajirin had already included *sanad* and *matn* although the discussion on the chance of transmission was very simple. According to Shaykh Muhajirin, it was because the discussion of sanad did not become the main focus of *Misbah alzulam*. He gave emphases on its discussion of the law of Islam.<sup>29</sup>

#### *Ikhtilāf al-ḥadīth* in Muhajirin's View

In the early 20<sup>th</sup> century, the books of hadith have not been made as a main source of reference yet in Islamic boarding schools. At that time, the scholars of hadith begin to give more attention to the study of hadith by collecting the books of hadith which then were translated and made as the subjects taught in the education institution of madrasa and Islamic boarding school. No books of hadith were written by Indonesian scholars in the beginning of 20<sup>th</sup> century, as the separate basic study of hadith in Islamic boarding schools. The study of hadith in Indonesia was still in the realm of introduction.

Such a fact can be described in the following table of the understanding method of *Mukhtalaf al-Ḥadīth* according to Muhajirin in the book of *Miṣbāḥ al-Zulām*<sup>30</sup>:

No	Problem	Method of Understanding			
		Al-Jam'	Al-Naskh	Al-Tarjīḥ	Al-Tawaqquf
1	Size of the clean water	√			
2	<i>Basmalah</i> in ablution (wudlu)	√			
3	Touching the skin of opposite sex abrogates the ablution	√			
4	Touching the genital part abrogate the ablution		√		
5	Punishment for marital intercourse to husband and wife during the fasting time of Ramadan			√	
6	Shalat after Subuh and Asar	√			
7	Reading of adzan			√	
8	Passing in front of the people			√	

<sup>29</sup> Dakir and Avivy, "Ketokohan Sheikh."

<sup>30</sup> Amsar, *Miṣbāḥ al-Zulām*.

No	Problem	Method of Understanding			
		Al-Jam'	Al-Naskh	Al-Tarjīh	Al-Tawaqquf
	performing Shalat abrogate his/ her Shalat				
9	Adorning the mosque	√			
10	Reading <i>Iftitāh</i>				√
11	<i>Basmalah</i> in <i>al-Fātīhah</i>	√			
12	Qunut of Subuh			√	
13	Time for prostration of forgetfulness (Sahwi)				√
14	Number of rakat for <i>Qabliyyah</i> Asar				√
15	The law of Shalat Witr			√	
16	The law of communal prayer			√	
17	Talking while speech				√
18	Time for approved praying (ijabah)	√			
19	Steps for Shalat <i>Khauf</i>				√
20	Shalat <i>Qabliyyah</i> and <i>Ba'diyyah</i> of Shalat Ied	√			
21	Eclipse prayer			√	
22	Speech at Shalat <i>Istisqā'</i>	√			
23	Men wearing silk	√			
24	The number of takbir when performing Islamic funeral prayer			√	
25	Mourning at someone's death	√			
26	Visiting grave		√		
27	Visiting grave for women	√			
28	Regretting the death	√			
29	Zakat for the disbelievers	√			
30	<i>Bekam</i> (traditional healing of taking out dirt blood from the body) abrogates the fasting	√			
31	Fasting on Saturday		√		
32	Law of Umroh				√
33	Getting married while in <i>Ihrām</i>			√	
34	Selling the slave	√			
35	Finding precious objects	√			
36	Will to the heirs	√			
37	Right to choose for the slave (wife) after being freed			√	
38	Remarried couples after converting to Islam			√	
39	Mahr	√			

No	Problem	Method of Understanding			
		Al-Jam'	Al-Naskh	Al-Tarjih	Al-Tawaqquf
40	Blowing out the drinks	√			
41	Announcing triple talaq (repudiation) at one time	√			
42	Feeding size to be <i>Mahram</i>			√	
43	Qisas (retaliation in kind) for parents who kills their children			√	
44	Qisas (retaliation in kind) for killing the disbelievers	√			
45	Fines for committing mistakes				√
46	Punishment for being murtad (apostasy)			√	
47	Ensuring the confession of an offender			√	
48	The number of lashes for unmarried adulterer	√			
49	Fighting an old disbeliever	√			
50	Eating <i>Dabb</i> (Lizard)			√	
51	Law of sacrifice			√	
52	The number of goats for aqiqah of son	√			
53	Drinking while standing	√			
54	Divisive people will not go to heaven	√			

Muhajirin uses four methods for understanding contradiction of hadith. From 54 cases of contradictions in the book of *Miṣbāḥ al-Zulām*, Muhajirin uses the method of al-Jam' as much as 27; al-Naskh = 3; al-Tarjih = 17; and al-Tawaqquf = 7. Half of those cases (in percentage) are settled by compromising the conflicting hadith. Almost one-thirds of those cases are settled by favoring one hadith compared to another hadith. Meanwhile, at a very little occasion, Muhajirin uses the method of hadith elimination due to another hadith. And for some cases, he does not give any comments firmly from their writings. He only describes several views from the scholars relating to the understanding of such conflicting hadith.

Among the examples of hadith settled by way of a compromise between two or more conflicting hadith are some histories in the reading of Basmallah when performing shalat. *First*

*hadith* explains that according to the information given by ‘Aisyah, the Prophet does not read basmalah after takbir, but he directly begins with al-Fatihah by reading of "*Al-Hamd li Allah Rabb al-‘Ālamīn*" (until the end of *hadith*). As narrated by Muslim:

عَنْ عَائِشَةَ، قَالَتْ: كَانَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ «يَسْتَفْتِحُ الصَّلَاةَ بِالتَّكْبِيرِ. وَالْقِرَاءَةِ، بِِ الْحَمْدِ لِلَّهِ رَبِّ الْعَالَمِينَ، وَكَانَ إِذَا رَكَعَ لَمْ يُشْخِصْ رَأْسَهُ، وَلَمْ يُصَوِّبْهُ وَلَكِنْ بَيْنَ ذَلِكَ، وَكَانَ إِذَا رَفَعَ رَأْسَهُ مِنَ الرُّكُوعِ لَمْ يَسْجُدْ، حَتَّى يَسْتَوِيَ قَائِمًا، وَكَانَ إِذَا رَفَعَ رَأْسَهُ مِنَ السَّجْدَةِ، لَمْ يَسْجُدْ حَتَّى يَسْتَوِيَ جَالِسًا، وَكَانَ يَقُولُ فِي كُلِّ رُكْعَتَيْنِ التَّحِيَّاتِ، وَكَانَ يَفْرِشُ رِجْلَهُ الْيُسْرَى وَيَنْصِبُ رِجْلَهُ الْيُمْنَى، وَكَانَ يَنْهَى عَنْ عَقْبَةِ الشَّيْطَانِ. وَيَنْهَى أَنْ يَفْتَرِشَ الرَّجُلُ رِجْلَيْهِ افْتِرَاشَ السَّعْيِ، وَكَانَ يَخْتِمُ الصَّلَاةَ بِالتَّسْلِيمِ» وَفِي رِوَايَةِ ابْنِ نُمَيْرٍ، عَنْ أَبِي خَالِدٍ، وَكَانَ يَنْهَى عَنْ عَقْبِ الشَّيْطَانِ<sup>31</sup>.

‘A’isha reported: The Messenger of Allah began prayer with the takbir (Allah is most great) and with reciting “Praise be to Allah, the Lord of the Universe”. And when he bowed, he neither raised up nor lowered down his head, but kept it between the two (conditions). And when he raised his head after bowing, he did not prostrate himself until he stood up straight; and when he raised his head after prostration, he did not prostrate (the second time) until he sat down properly; and he recited *al-tahiyyat* after every pair of *rak’a*; and when he sat, he spread out his left foot and raised his right. He forbade to sit like the sitting of the devil, and to spread out to hands (on the ground in prostration) like animals. He used to finish prayer with uttering the salutation.

The *second hadith* explains that according to Ummu Salamah, the Prophet’s reading when shalat is "*Bismillah al-Rahmān al-Rahīm. Al-Hamd li Allāh Rabb al-‘Ālamīn*" (until the end of *hadith*). As narrated by Abu Daud:

<sup>31</sup> Abū al-Ḥusayn ‘Asākir al-Dīn Muslim ibn al-Hajjāj al-Naysābūrī, *Ṣaḥīḥ Muslim* (Beirut: Dār Ihyā’ al-Turāth al-‘Arabī, n.d.), 1/357.



عَنْ أُمِّ سَلَمَةَ، أَنَّهَا ذَكَرَتْ أَوْ كَلِمَةً غَيْرَهَا "قِرَاءَةَ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ: بِسْمِ اللَّهِ الرَّحْمَنِ الرَّحِيمِ. الْحَمْدُ لِلَّهِ رَبِّ الْعَالَمِينَ. الرَّحْمَنِ الرَّحِيمِ. مَلِكِ يَوْمِ الدِّينِ. يُقَطِّعُ قِرَاءَتَهُ آيَةً آيَةً".<sup>32</sup>

Umm Salamah Reported: The Messenger of Allah used to recite: "In the name of Allah, the Cherisher and Sustainer of the worlds; most Gracious, most Merciful; Master of the Day of Judgment," breaking its recitation into verses, one after another

In this case, Muhajirin Amsar gives comment:

حمل هذا الحديث (حديث عائشة) الاستفتاح بسورة الحمد لله رب العالمين المتضمن للبسملة

Meaning: Hadith by 'Aisyah is possibly leading to a meaning that reading al-Fatihah starting from " *Al-Hamd li Allāh Rabb al-‘Ālamīn* " indicates the reading of basmalah.<sup>33</sup>

Among the examples of hadith settled by way of elimination is in the case of fasting on Saturday and Sunday. There is a hadith explaining that the Prophet is fasting on Saturday and Sunday for couple of times, even frequently. But, the Prophet also said that those two days are the feast day of idolatrous people. As narrated by Ibn Khuzaymah in his Sahih:

أَنَّ ابْنَ عَبَّاسٍ، وَنَاسًا مِنْ أَصْحَابِ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ بَعَثُونِي إِلَى أُمِّ سَلَمَةَ، أَسْأَلُهَا الْأَيَّامَ كَانَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ أَكْثَرَ لَهَا صِيَامًا؟ قَالَتْ: يَوْمَ السَّبْتِ وَالْأَحَدِ، فَرَجَعْتُ إِلَيْهِمْ، فَأَخْبَرْتُهُمْ وَكَأَنَّهُمْ أَنْكَرُوا ذَلِكَ، فَقَامُوا بِأَجْمَعِهِمْ إِلَيْهَا، فَقَالُوا: إِنَّا بَعَثْنَا إِلَيْكَ هَذَا فِي كَذَا وَكَذَا، وَذَكَرَ أَنَّكَ قُلْتَ: كَذَا وَكَذَا، فَقَالَتْ: صَدَقَ، إِنَّ رَسُولَ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ أَكْثَرَ مَا كَانَ يَصُومُ مِنَ الْأَيَّامِ يَوْمَ السَّبْتِ وَالْأَحَدِ، كَانَ يَقُولُ: «إِنَّهُمَا يَوْمَا عِيدٍ لِلْمُشْرِكِينَ وَأَنَا أُرِيدُ أَنْ أُخَالِفَهُمْ».<sup>34</sup>

<sup>32</sup> Abū Dāwūd Sulaymān ibn al-Ash'ath as-Sijistānī Abū Dāwūd, *Sunan Abū Dāwūd* (Beirut: al-Maktabah al-'Asriyyah, n.d.), 4/37.

<sup>33</sup> Amsar, *Miṣbāḥ al-Zulām*, 15/2.

<sup>34</sup> Muḥammad ibn Ishāq Ibn Khuzaymah, *Ṣaḥīḥ ibn Khuzaymah* (Beirut: al-Maktab al-Islāmī, n.d.), 3/318.

From Kuraib, Verily Ibn 'Abbas and a group of Sahaba sent me on Umm Salamah. I asked about the Prophet fasting, Umm Salamah said: "On Saturday and Monday" then I go back and spread the news of Umm Salamah, but they do not believe it. They went to Umm Salama and said that we have sent someone for this purpose, he told me that you said like this. Umm Salamah said: "absolutely Saturday and Monday is a feast for idolatrous people, and I would like to differ with them.

Muhajirin gives comment as follow:

وقوله في الحديث: كان أكثر ما يصوم من الأيام يوم السبت محمول على أنه في أول الأمر، وتقدمت الإسارة إلى ذلك.

Muhajirin understands that the words "the prophet often fasted on Saturday" become a clue that such matter is done by the prophet long before his sayings stating "actually those both days are the feast days of idolatrous people".<sup>35</sup>

Among the examples of hadith settled by means of favoring one hadith compared to another hadith is in the case of a person performing shalat whose place of prostration/ shalat is passed by another person or an animal. *First hadith* explains that a person's shalat becomes void if not giving a barrier at its place of prostration/ shalat, then passed by a women, donkey, and black dog. As narrated by Muslim:

عَنْ أَبِي ذَرٍّ، قَالَ: قَالَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ: إِذَا قَامَ أَحَدُكُمْ يُصَلِّي، فَإِنَّهُ يَسْتُرُهُ إِذَا كَانَ بَيْنَ يَدَيْهِ مِثْلَ آخِرَةِ الرَّحْلِ، فَإِذَا لَمْ يَكُنْ بَيْنَ يَدَيْهِ مِثْلَ آخِرَةِ الرَّحْلِ، فَإِنَّهُ يَقْطَعُ صَلَاتَهُ الْحِمَارُ، وَالْمَرْأَةُ، وَالْكَلْبُ الْأَسْوَدُ» قُلْتُ: يَا أَبَا ذَرٍّ، مَا بَالُ الْكَلْبِ الْأَسْوَدِ مِنَ الْكَلْبِ الْأَحْمَرِ؟ قَالَ: يَا ابْنَ أَخِي، سَأَلْتُ رَسُولَ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ كَمَا سَأَلْتَنِي فَقَالَ: «الْكَلْبُ الْأَسْوَدُ شَيْطَانٌ»<sup>36</sup>.

The messenger of Allah said: "When anyone of you stands to pray, then he is screened if he has in front of him something as high as the back of a camel saddle. If he does not have something

<sup>35</sup> Amsar, *Miṣbāḥ al-Zulām*, 1/184.

<sup>36</sup> al-Naysābūrī, *Ṣaḥīḥ Muslim*, 1/365.

as high as the back of a camel saddle in front of him, then his prayer is nullified by a woman, a donkey or a black dog." I (one of the narrators) said: "What is the difference between a black dog, a yellow one and a red one?" He said: I asked the Messenger of Allah just like you and he said: "The black dog is a shaitan.

And the second hadith explains that someone's prayer will not be void by anything. As narrated by Abu Daud:

عَنْ أَبِي سَعِيدٍ، قَالَ: قَالَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ: لَا يَفْطَعُ الصَّلَاةَ شَيْءٌ وَادْرَأُوا مَا اسْتَطَعْتُمْ فَإِنَّمَا هُوَ شَيْطَانٌ.<sup>37</sup>

Abu Sa'id reported: There is nothing that can undo prayer and reject those who want to pass in front of you as much as you, because he (is forced to pass in front of the prayer) is the devil.

Muhajirin gives comment as follow:

لما نزعنا الأحاديث في الشيء الذي يقطع الصلاة نظرا إلى ما عمل به أصحاب رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم، لأن هؤلاء أدرى بواقعة الحال.

Muhajirin sees that both hadith must return its understanding to what the Companions do, because they knew about the intention contained in the Prophet's hadith. Ibn 'Abbas once narrated a hadith that explained about the cancelled shalat when others passed in front of its place of prostration. But, Ibn 'Abbas once decreed that after the prophet died, a donkey, dog and women that passed in front of a person performing shalat would not abrogate that prayer. In addition, 'Aisyah was also angry when she heard some of his companions said about the prophet's hadith that woman who passed in front of the prayer would cancel the shalat. She said: "Did you equate us with donkeys and dogs?"<sup>38</sup>

Among the examples of hadith settled by way of not compromising, not eliminating one of them, and also not favoring one of the them, but not giving definitive explanation, and instead giving explanation upon each content of the conflicting hadith in order to illustrate that both hadith are well acceptable, according to the tendency of its reader, is in the case of reading *iftitah*

<sup>37</sup> Abū Dāwūd, *Sunan Abū Dāwūd*, 1/191.

<sup>38</sup> Amsar, *Miṣbāḥ al-Zulām*, 1/182.

(opening supplication) in prayer. *First hadith* explains that the reading of *iftita* in *shalat* is “*Wajjahtu Wajhiya li al-Ladhī Faṭara al-Samāwāt wa al-’Arḍ* until the end of the prayer”. As narrated by Muslim:

عَلِيٌّ بْنُ أَبِي طَالِبٍ، عَنْ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ، أَنَّهُ كَانَ إِذَا قَامَ إِلَى الصَّلَاةِ، قَالَ: «وَجَّهْتُ وَجْهِي لِلَّذِي فَطَرَ السَّمَاوَاتِ وَالْأَرْضَ حَنِيفًا، وَمَا أَنَا مِنَ الْمُشْرِكِينَ، إِنَّ صَلَاتِي، وَنُسُكِي، وَمَحْيَايَ، وَمَمَاتِي لِلَّهِ رَبِّ الْعَالَمِينَ، لَا شَرِيكَ لَهُ، وَبِذَلِكَ أُمِرْتُ وَأَنَا مِنَ الْمُسْلِمِينَ، اللَّهُمَّ أَنْتَ الْمَلِكُ لَا إِلَهَ إِلَّا أَنْتَ أَنْتَ رَبِّي، وَأَنَا عَبْدُكَ، ظَلَمْتُ نَفْسِي، وَاعْتَرَفْتُ بِذُنُوبِي، فَاعْفِرْ لِي ذُنُوبِي جَمِيعًا، إِنَّهُ لَا يَغْفِرُ الذُّنُوبَ إِلَّا أَنْتَ، وَاهْدِنِي لِأَحْسَنِ الْأَخْلَاقِ لَا يَهْدِي لِأَحْسَنِهَا إِلَّا أَنْتَ، وَاصْرِفْ عَنِّي سَيِّئًا لَا يَصْرِفُ عَنِّي سَيِّئًا إِلَّا أَنْتَ، لَبَّيْكَ وَسَعْدَيْكَ وَالْخَيْرُ كُلُّهُ فِي يَدَيْكَ، وَالشَّرُّ لَيْسَ إِلَيْكَ، أَنَا بِكَ وَإِلَيْكَ، تَبَارَكْتَ وَتَعَالَيْتَ، أَسْتَغْفِرُكَ وَأَتُوبُ إِلَيْكَ»<sup>39</sup>.

Reported 'Ali Bin Abi Talib: That when the Prophet stood for prayer, he would make the *takbir* (rising hand in prayer) and then say, "I have turned my face to the One Who created the heavens and the earth as a sincere submissive (person), and I am not one of the polytheists. My prayers, my sacrifice, my life and my death are all for Allah, the Lord of the Worlds; No partner with Him (in all that). That is what I have been ordered and I am of those who submit. O Allah, you are the King and there is no Lord besides You. You are my Lord and I am Your slave. I have wronged my soul and You are aware of my sins, so forgive all of my sins. No one forgives sins save You. Guide me to the best character. No one can guide to the best of that save You. Turn me away from its evil, and no one can turn me from its evil save You. At your beck and call, here I am (to serve you) all the good is in Your hands and evil is not to You. And I am for You, and to You are the blessings and the exaltedness. I seek your forgiveness O Allah and return unto You.

And the *second hadith* explains that the reading of *iftitah* in *shalat* is “*Allāhumma Bā'id Baynī wa Bayn Khaṭāyāy kamā Bā'adta Bayn al-Mashriq wa al-Magrib* until the end of the prayer”. As narrated by Muslim:

<sup>39</sup> al-Naysābūrī, *Ṣaḥīḥ Muslim*, 1/534.

عَنْ أَبِي هُرَيْرَةَ، قَالَ: كَانَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ، إِذَا كَبَّرَ فِي الصَّلَاةِ، سَكَتَ هُنَيْئَةً قَبْلَ أَنْ يَقْرَأَ، فَقُلْتُ: يَا رَسُولَ اللَّهِ بِأَيِّ أَنْتَ وَأُمِّي أَرَأَيْتَ سَكُوتَكَ بَيْنَ التَّكْبِيرِ وَالْقِرَاءَةِ، مَا تَقُولُ؟ قَالَ " أَقُولُ: اللَّهُمَّ بَاعِدْ بَيْنِي وَبَيْنَ خَطَايَايَ كَمَا بَاعَدْتَ بَيْنَ الْمَشْرِقِ وَالْمَغْرِبِ، اللَّهُمَّ نَقِّنِي مِنْ خَطَايَايَ كَمَا يُنْقَى الثَّوْبُ الْأَبْيَضُ مِنَ الدَّنَسِ، اللَّهُمَّ اغْسِلْنِي مِنَ خَطَايَايَ بِالثَّلْجِ وَالْمَاءِ وَالْبَرَدِ .<sup>40</sup>

Reported Abu Hurairah, "When the Prophet made the opening takbir, he would be quiet for a little while before his recitation. I asked him, 'O Messenger of Allah, may my father and mother be sacrificed for you, why are you quiet between the (opening) takbir and your recitation? What do you say (at that time)?' He said, 'I say, "O Allah, make the distance between me and my sins as far as you have made the distance between the East and the West. O Allah, cleanse me of my sins as a white garment is cleansed of dirt. O Allah, purify me from my sins by snow, rain and hail.

And the *third* *hadith* explains that the reading of *iftita* in shalat is "*Subhānaka Allāhumma wa biḥamdik* until the end of the prayer". As narrated by Nasai:

عَنْ أَبِي سَعِيدٍ، أَنَّ النَّبِيَّ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ كَانَ إِذَا افْتَتَحَ الصَّلَاةَ قَالَ: «سُبْحَانَكَ اللَّهُمَّ وَبِحَمْدِكَ تَبَارَكَ اسْمُكَ وَتَعَالَى جَدُّكَ وَلَا إِلَهَ غَيْرُكَ»<sup>41</sup>.

Narrated Abu Saeed: He said: When the messenger of Allah used to stand in prayer, he would say: "Glory be to You, O Allah, and to You is the praise. Blessed is Your name and most high is Your honor. There is no Lord besides You".

And the fourth *hadith* explains that the reading of *iftitah* in shalat is "*A'ūdhu bi Allāh al-Samī' al-'Alīm min al-Shayṭān al-Rajīm min Hamzih wa Nafkhih wa Nafthih*". As narrated by Abu Daud:

عَنْ أَبِي سَعِيدٍ الْخُدْرِيِّ، قَالَ: كَانَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ إِذَا قَامَ مِنَ اللَّيْلِ كَبَّرَ، ثُمَّ يَقُولُ: سُبْحَانَكَ اللَّهُمَّ وَبِحَمْدِكَ وَتَبَارَكَ اسْمُكَ، وَتَعَالَى جَدُّكَ، وَلَا

<sup>40</sup> Ibid., 1/419.

<sup>41</sup> Abū 'Abd al-Raḥmān Aḥmad ibn Shu'ayb ibn 'Alī ibn Sīnān al-Nasā'ī, *Sunan al-Nasā'ī* (Halb: Maktab al-Maṭbū'at al-Islāmiyyah, 1986), 2/132.

إِلَهَ غَيْرِكَ، ثُمَّ يَقُولُ: لَا إِلَهَ إِلَّا اللَّهُ ثَلَاثًا، ثُمَّ يَقُولُ: اللَّهُ أَكْبَرُ كَبِيرًا ثَلَاثًا، أَعُوذُ بِاللَّهِ السَّمِيعِ الْعَلِيمِ مِنَ الشَّيْطَانِ الرَّجِيمِ مِنْ هَمْزِهِ، وَنَفْخِهِ، وَنَفْثِهِ.<sup>42</sup>

Narrated Abu Saeed: He said: When the messenger of Allah used to stand in prayer in the late night, he would say the takbeer and say: "Glory be to You, O Allah, and to You is the praise. Blessed is Your name and most high is Your honor. There is no Lord besides You." "O Allah, I seek refuge in You from Satan the accursed and from his pricking, spittle and puffing".

Muhajirin gives comment as follow:

فخلاصة الأقوال أن الشافعي يستفتح بوجهت وجبي (إلخ)، وأن الحنفي وأحمد يستفتحون بسبحانك اللهم (إلخ)، وأن مالكا لم ير الاستفتاح كما تقدم، ومن استفتح بوجهت وجبي يجوز له أن يزيد بسبحانك الله (إلخ) وعكسه.

Seeing those four hadith above, Muhajirin explains that each hadith becomes the guideline for each of the schools (mazhab) in performing shalat. The school of Syafi'iyah uses the reading of "Wajjahtu Wajhiya", while the schools of Hanafiyah and Ahmad use the reading of "Subhanaka Allahumma". Afterward, Muhajirin confirms that each of the schools may add another prayer included in the text of hadith made as the guideline for other schools.<sup>43</sup>

The above examples give an illustration that the case of contradiction hadith has become an emphasis in the study of hadith commentaries in Indonesia during the 20<sup>th</sup> century, and it also places Muhajirin as one of the scholars in Nusantara contributing to the development study of hadith in Indonesia.

The study given by Muhajirin is very interesting, because he attempts to get into the study of hadith that is quite difficult and not easy for an expert of hadith. Muhajirin had got a lot of things when travelling for learning Islamic knowledge in Haramain. It makes him as a figure with high capability in the field of hadith. Later, He developed the knowledge he got in Haramain in his works in the field of Syarah Hadith.

<sup>42</sup> Abū Dāwūd, *Sunan Abū Dāwūd*, 1/206.

<sup>43</sup> Amsar, *Miṣbāḥ al-Zulām*, 1/214.

From the example above, Muhajirin attempts to understand the contradicting hadith at his best. Thus, no hadith with a strong sanad was neglected, either by removing or excluding it. Muhajirin attempts to think of its understanding in order to make it as an alternative between such conflicting hadith.

## Conclusion

The methodology of understanding *mukhtalaf hadith* in Indonesia in the 20<sup>th</sup> century established by Muhajirin tends to try to avoid the method of *al-naskh* (removing one hadith with another hadith). The author tends to find an acceptable way for both parties to resolve the contradicting hadith. Drawing on the 54 cases of conflicting hadith in the book of *Mishbah al-Zulam*, Muhajirin understood it by compromising such hadith into 27 cases, meaning that from 50% of the cases, he tried to compromise with his deep understanding upon any aspects in such cases.

The characteristics of the book of hadith commentaries in Indonesia in the 20<sup>th</sup> century show a very significant development of the study of hadith. Muhajirin plays important role in this field of study by entering the area of *Hadith Mukhtalaf*, which was a very complicated area, since it was considered as the peak of nobility for a scholar of hadith. The finding of this study can become an entry point to further explore the study of the development of hadith in Indonesia in modern times which still receive a small attention from scholars.

## References

- Abdur-Rahman, M.A., Abdul Mutalib Embong, Muhammad Ridhuan Tony Lim Abdullah, Mashitah Sabdin, Raja Ahmad Iskandar Raja Yaacob, and Mohd Pisol Mat Isa. "Historical Review of Classical Hadith Literature in Malay Peninsula." *International Journal of Basic and Applied Sciences* 11, no. 2 (2011).
- Abū Dāwūd, Abū Dāwūd Sulaymān ibn al-Ash'ath as-Sijistānī. *Sunan Abū Dāwūd*. Beirut: al-Maktabah al-'Aşriyyah, n.d.
- Al-Sakhāwi, Muḥammad ibn 'Abd al-Raḥmān ibn Muḥammad. *Fath al-Mugīth bi Sharḥ Alfiyyat al-Ḥadīth li al-'Irāqī*. Cairo: Maktabah al-Sunnah, 2003.

- Al-Shāfi'ī, Muḥammad ibn Idrīs. *Al-Risālat*. Cairo: Maktabat al-Halabi, 1940.
- Amsar, Muhammad Muhajirin al-Dari Bekasi. *Miṣbāḥ al-Zulām Sharḥ Bulūg al-Marām min Adillat al-Aḥkām*. Bekasi, 1991.
- — —. *Sejarah Singkat Perjalanan Hidup Syeikh Muhammad Muhajirin Amsar Addary*. Bekasi: Pesantren Annida Al-Islamy Bekasi, 2007.
- Azra, Azyumardi. *Jaringan Ulama Timur Tengah dan Kepulauan Nusantara Abad XVII dan XVIII*. Bandung: Mizan, 1998.
- Brown, Jonathan A. C. "Criticism of the Proto-Hadith Canon: Al-Daraqutni's Adjustment of the Sahihayn." *Journal of Islamic Studies* 15, no. 1 (January 1, 2004): 1–37.
- van Bruinessen, Martin. "A Note on Source Materials for The Biographies of Southeast Asian Ulama." *La Transmission du Savoir Dans le Monde Musulman Peripherique, Lettre d'information* 17 (1997): 57–66.
- — —. *Kitab Kuning Pesantren dan Tarekat, Tradisi-Tradisi Islam di Indonesia*. Bandung: Mizan, 1999.
- Dakir, Jawiah, and Ahmad Levi Fachrul Avivy. "Ketokohan Sheikh Muhammad Muhajirin Amsar Al-Dary Sebagai Ilmuan Hadis Nusantara: Analisis Terhadap Kitab Miṣbāḥ Al-Zulām Sharḥ Bulūg Al-Marām." In *Prosiding Nadwah Ulama Nusantara (NUN) IV*, 231–236. Bangi, Selangor: University Kebangsaan Malaysia, 2011.  
<http://www.ukm.my/nun/prosiding%20atas%20talian.htm>.
- Danarto, Agung. *Kajian Hadis di Indonesia Tahun 1900-1945 (Tela'ah terhadap Pemikiran Beberapa Ulama tentang Hadis)*. Yogyakarta: Proyek Perguruan Tinggi Islam IAIN Sunan Kalijaga, 2000.
- bin Deraman, Fauzi, and Mohd Asmawi bin Muhammad. "Karya-Karya 'Ulum al-Hadith di Nusantara: Satu Sorotan." *Al-Bayan Journal of Qur'an and Hadith Studies* 8 (2013).
- Fathurrahman, Oman. "The Roots of the Writing Tradition of Ḥadīth Works in Nusantara: Hidāyat Al-Ḥabīb by Nūr Al-Dīn Al-Rānirī." *Studi Islamika Indonesian Journal for Islamic Studies* 19, no. 1 (2012): 47–76.
- Fathurrahman, Oman, and Munawar Holil. *Katalog Naskah Ali Hasjmy Aceh*. Jakarta: PPIM dan Yayasan Pendidikan dan Museum Ali Hasjmy Banda Aceh, Masyarakat Komunitas



- Nusantara [MANASSA], Centre for Documentation and Area-Transcultural Studies [C-DATS], Tokyo University of Foreign Studies [TUFS], 2007.
- Federspiel, Howard M. *The Usage of Tradition of the Prophet in Contemporary Indonesia*. Arizona: Program for SAS, 1993.
- Ghazali, Abdul Moqsiith. "Ulama Arab dan Ulama Indonesia." *Islamlib*. Last modified Oktober 2008. Accessed February 11, 2016. <http://islamlib.com/gagasan/islamnusantara/ulama-arab-dan-ulama-indonesia/>.
- Ḥammād, Nafiz Husayn. *Mukhtalaf al-Ḥadīth Bayn al-Fuqahā' wa al-Muḥaddithīn*. Cairo: Dār al-Wafā', 1993.
- al-Nasā'ī, Abū 'Abd al-Raḥmān Aḥmad ibn Shu'ayb ibn 'Alī ibn Sīnān. *Sunan al-Nasā'ī*. Ḥalb: Maktab al-Maṭbū'at al-Islāmiyyah, 1986.
- Ibn Khuzaymah, Muḥammad ibn Ishāq. *Ṣaḥīḥ ibn Khuzaymah*. Beirut: al-Maktab al-Islāmī, n.d.
- Ismail, M. Syuhudi. *Hadis Nabi Menurut Pembela, Peningkar, dan Pemalsunya*. Jakarta: Bulan Bintang, 1995.
- Muhajirin. "Transmisi Hadis di Nusantara: Peran Ulama Hadis Nusantara Muḥammad Maḥfūz al-Tarmasī." Dissertation, UIN Syarif Hidayatullah, 2009.
- al-Naysābūrī, Abū al-Ḥusayn 'Asākir al-Dīn Muslim ibn al-Ḥajjāj. *Ṣaḥīḥ Muslim*. Beirut: Dār Ihyā' al-Turāth al-'Arabī, n.d.
- Ṣāliḥ, Muḥammad Adīb. *Lamḥat fī Uṣūl al-Ḥadīth*. Beirut: al-Maktab al-Islāmiyyah, 1978.
- Steenbrink, Karel A. "Beberapa Aspek Tentang Islam di Indonesia Abad 19." In *Beberapa Aspek tentang Islam di Indonesia Abad 19*. Jakarta: Bulan Bintang, 1984.
- Tasrif, Muh. "Studi Hadis di Indonesia (Telaah Historis terhadap Studi Hadis dari Abad XVII – Sekarang)." *Jurnal Studi Ilmu-ilmu Al-Quran dan Hadis* 5, no. 1 (January 2004).
- Zarif, Muhammad Mustaqim Mohd. "Jawah Hadis Scholarship in the Nineteenth Century: A Comparative Study of the Adaptions of Lubāb Al-Ḥadīth Composed by Nawawi of Banten (d. 1314/1897) and Wan 'Alī of Kelantan (d. 1331/1913)." Dissertation, University of Edinburgh, 2007.